

Philosophy 2330: Science and Society: Philosophy of Medicine  
Fall 2022  
Second short essay assignment

Please complete your essay and upload it into Blackboard on or before Monday, Oct 24th (late penalties will begin to apply after class on Tuesday, Oct 25<sup>th</sup>).

You are to write an argumentative essay between one and two pages (500-700 words) discussing the following issue: When we are trying to predict what will happen as the result of a medical intervention (say a drug or a surgery) what kind of evidence is best? What kind is required?

Here are some prompts to get you started on your thinking:

In chapter 7 of *Care and Cure*, Stegenga describes *The Black Box Thesis* and *The Mechanista Thesis*. What are these views? To what extent is either of the views plausible?

Stegenga talks about two different kinds of extrapolation – moving from animal models to humans and moving from one human population to another. Discuss the similarities and differences between the two types of extrapolation problems. For example, is the way to deal with these problems fundamentally the same? Or very different? In what kinds of cases do you think extrapolation is justified? You might also want to think about other kinds of cases like moving from men to women or adults to children or college age students who volunteered for a study to college age students who didn't volunteer or ...